COVID-19 misinformation in anti-vaccination websites: a content analysis of archived websites

SAMANTHA KAPLAN
MEGAN VON ISENBURG
LUCY WALDROPP
DUKE UNIVERSITY MEDICAL CENTER LIBRARY & ARCHIVES
Research Team

Megan von Isenburg, MSLS AHIP
Associate Dean for Library Services & Archives
megan.vonisenburg@duke.edu

Lucy Waldrop, MLIS, MA
Assistant Director for Medical Center Archives
lucy.waldrop@duke.edu

Sami Kaplan, PhD, MLIS
Research & Education Librarian
Liaison to School of Medicine
samantha.kaplan@duke.edu
Agenda

- Historical Context
- Capturing the Ephemera of Today
- J.B Handley Case
- COVID-19 Misinformation
- Web Archiving for Misinformation Research
Historical context
Historical Context

HTTPS://EXHIBITS.LIBRARY.DUKE.EDU/ITEMS/SHOW/12094

HARPER'S WEEKLY 1871

#HEALTHMISINFONNLM
Historical Context

Don’t Buy Medicine For Stomach Trouble

Better Than WHISKEY for Colds and Flu

So humiliated when she realized the cause of her husband’s frigidity

ZONITE: HTTPS://REPOSITORY.DUKE.EDU/DC/ADACCESS/BH0213
WHISKEY: HTTPS://REPOSITORY.DUKE.EDU/DC/MMA/MM0065
KONJOLA: HTTPS://REPOSITORY.DUKE.EDU/DC/MMA/MM0158

#HEALTHMISINFONLM
Present Day

My face when someone tells me they are not up to date with their recommended vaccines

HTTPS://WWW.BLEEDINGHEARTLAND.COM/2021/04/15/IOWA-HOUSE-REPUBLICAN-SHARES-ANTI-COVID-VACCINE-MEMES/
HTTPS://I0.WP.COM/WWW.NFID.ORG/WP-CONTENT/UPLOADS/2021/12/I-WANNA-GO-HOME-MEME-12.21.JPG?SSL=1
Capturing the ephemera of today
“The disappearance of heritage in whatever form constitutes an impoverishment of the heritage of all nations.”
Web archiving: why it matters

After one year, 80% of webpages are no longer available as they were originally published.

After 27 months, 13% of web references in scholarly articles disappear.
• 40 seeds (aka websites)
  ○ 27 anti-vaccination
  ○ 12 pro-vaccination
  ○ 1 anti and pro
• New seeds added
• Crawled every 6 months
• Collection: https://duke.is/wjy49
The case of J.B. Handley
J.B. Handley

About the Author

J.B. Handley is the best-selling author of How to End the Autism Epidemic and co-author with his son Jamie of a new book, Underestimated: An Autism Miracle. Together with his wife Lisa, he founded Generation Rescue, a non-profit organization dedicated to autism recovery. He and his wife also produced the documentary film Autism Yesterday. J.B. founded Swander Pace Capital, a middle-market private equity firm with more than $1.5 billion under management where he served as managing director for two decades. He is an honors graduate of Stanford University and lives in Portland, Oregon, with Lisa and their three children.

https://www.amazon.com/stores/author/B07G6XVFKN/about
j.b. handley blog

J.B. Handley: Autism Treatment and Recovery

J.B. Handley: Is there a path to end the autism epidemic?

J.B. Handley: International scientists have found autism's cause. What will Americans do now?
Is the science really settled?

Aug 9

Oregon's Governor Brown just tanked the school year

Aug 7

LOCKDOWN LUNACY 3.0: It's over

Jul 28

Oregon's COVID-19 data isn't scary, so why the panic?

Jul 1

---

j.b. handley blog
I was so wrong about autism (thank God!)

J.B. Handley: Autism Treatment and Recovery
Here comes SPELLERS, the year’s most important film

ASHA tells 50 million nonspeakers, “you aren’t capable.”

I was so wrong about autism (thank God!)

J.B. Handley: Autism Treatment and Recovery
What Happened?
Underestimated: An Autism Miracle (Children's Health Defense)

by J. B. Handley (Author), Jamison Handley (Author)  |  Format: Kindle Edition

Kindle $16.79 after credits  |  Hardcover $22.49

699 ratings

Great on Kindle

Great Experience. Great Value.

Enjoy a great reading experience, with a $1.70 credit back to spend on your next Great on Kindle book when you buy the Kindle edition of this book. Learn more about Great on Kindle, available in select categories.

The incredibly moving and inspiring story about a quest to finally be heard.

In Underestimated: An Autism Miracle, Generation Rescue's cofounder J.B. Handley and his teenage son Jamison tell the remarkable story of Jamison’s journey to find a method of communication that allowed him to show the world that he was a brilliant, wise, generous, and complex individual who had been misunderstood and underestimated by everyone in his life.

Publication date: March 25, 2021

Print length: 120 pages  |  Language: English  |  Sticky notes: On Kindle Scribe

Publisher: Skyhorse  |  File size: 1070 KB
COVID-19
Misinformation
COVID-19 and Anti-Vaccination Information Behavior

- Content analysis of the antivaccination websites in The Vaccination in Modern America Web Archive (n=25)
- Two pronged study:
  - Assess prepandemic anti-vax sites’ COVID behavior
  - Test the web archive
- Coding schema (informed by existing anti-vax research) and codebook available with the manuscript
- Websites were assessed across broad categories:
  - COVID-19 vaccines (whether they mentioned them at all or by brand name)
  - Personal freedom (masking, bodily integrity, stay-at-home orders)
  - Safety concerns (compromised research process, inclusion of specific ingredients)
  - Distrust of science and institutions (financial motivations, corruptions, biological warfare)
- Analysis occurred during Dec 2021-Jan 2022
- Archived and live sites were used
COVID-19 and Anti-Vaccination Information Behavior

- More than half (n=14, 56%) of sites solicited donations
- About half (n=12, 48%) mention their tax status. We did not collect tax status details, but sites largely purported to be nonprofits.
- In addition to collecting donations, 18 (72%) sites had a membership option of some kind.
- About two-thirds (n=16, 64%) of sites address COVID-19 vaccines in some way and
  - More than one-third mention at least 1 COVID-19 vaccine
    - Moderna was the most commonly mentioned (n=11, 44%), closely followed by Pfizer (n=9, 36%).
- 16 (64%) sites referencing some element of personal freedom
- 15 (60%) referencing skepticism of science and conspiracy concerns
- 52% referencing safety concerns
Prepandemic Antivaccination Websites' COVID-19 Vaccine Behavior: Content Analysis of Archived Websites

Samantha Kaplan 1 ; Megan von Isenburg 1 ; Lucy Waldrop 1

Abstract

Background:
The onset of the COVID-19 pandemic and the concurrent development of vaccines offered a rare and somewhat unprecedented opportunity to study antivaccination behavior as it formed over time via the use of archived versions of websites.

Objective:
This study aims to assess how existing antivaccination websites modified their content to address COVID-19 vaccines and pandemic restrictions.

Methods:
Using a preexisting collection of 25 antivaccination websites curated by the IvyPlus Web Collection Program prior to the pandemic and crawled every 6 months via Archive-It, we conducted a content analysis to see how these websites acknowledged or ignored COVID-19 vaccines and pandemic restrictions. Websites were assessed for financial behaviors such as having storefronts, mention of COVID-19 vaccines in general or by manufacturer name, references to personal freedom such as masking, safety concerns like side effects, and skepticism of science.

https://duke.is/8rdx6
Observations on using web archives for misinformation research
What Works

• Seeing what is missing can lead to understanding changes
• Much site content is captured
What Doesn’t Work

• Graphics, videos, external links
• Search
• Slow processing times
• Premium content behind paywall
• Newsletters
• Social media
Concerns for the present and the future

- Content “expires”
- Adopted indicators of quality, such as seals of approval (Charity Navigator)
- Platform hopping
- Using strategies that avoid capture, like premium and newsletter
Natural Immunity Is as Protective as COVID Jab

Analysis by Dr. Joseph Mercola — Fact Checked

March 07, 2023

Covid natural immunity confirmed

WHERE IT LEADS...

STORY AT-A-GLANCE

A recent systematic review and meta-analysis found natural immunity is "at least as high, if not higher" than that provided by two mRNA vaccines.

HTTPS://WWW.MERCOLA.COM/
According to Kirsch, this is yet another "nail in the coffin" for the COVID jab. Alas, there are major errors and flaws in the data that allows the British government to claim the jabbed are doing better than the unjabbed, so this nail is still unlikely to seal the proverbial COVID COVID casket shut.

"The unjabbed are undercounted by about 50%. Once the data is corrected, the boosted actually have higher non-COVID mortality than the unjabbed."

For example, the unjabbed are undercounted by about 50%, so in the ONS report, it appears they have somewhat higher mortality than those who got one or more injections. Once the data is corrected, the boosted actually have higher non-COVID mortality than the unjabbed.

In summary, the key findings from the U.K. ONS data set are that excess mortality has steadily risen in 2022 while the attribution of deaths to COVID-19 has steadily declined. So, something other than COVID is killing people at an exaggerated rate, and no one in government can figure out what that is.

A Master’s Course in Data Manipulation

The data manipulation that doggedly persistent analysts have unearthed over the past three years truly boggle the mind. Governments around the world have been caught using every conceivable trick to obscure data that would otherwise break the narrative that COVID-19 is a significant threat, early treatment doesn’t work and the experimental COVID jabs are safe and effective.

I’ve covered many (but certainly not all) of these tactics as they were discovered. In closing, here’s yet another one.

In the Substack, “Where Are the Numbers?” Norman Fenton (a mathematician and computer scientist) and Martin Neil (a computer science and statistics professor) provide a step-by-step guide on how to manufacture ‘high-efficacy illusions’ such as a study that claims the COVID shot is 90% effective even when the jabbed and un jabbed are infected. As noted by Fenton and Neil.
Create the Virus and Get Paid for the Vaccine

In related news, Moderna recently agreed to pay $400 million to the National Institute of Allergy and Infectious Diseases (NIAID) for the patent it holds to its mRNA shot. The patent process is a part of the COVID mRNA shots that the media haven't really addressed.

As it turns out, behind the scenes, the manufacturers not only are fighting with the federal government over the core technology's origins but have been in ongoing litigation over it. Now, Moderna has finally agreed to pay.

According to Fierce Pharma, Moderna revealed in its latest earnings statement that the company had agreed to "a $400 million 'catch-up payment' under a royalty-bearing license agreement between the parties."

So, does the payment hit the company hard? "Moderna pulled down around $36 billion in COVID-19 vaccine sales across 2021 and 2022, its two big launch years," Fierce Pharma said, adding, "While the $400 million payment represents only around 1% of the company's total COVID-19 vaccine sales over that span, the lump-sum nature of the 'catch-up payment' drove up Moderna's fourth quarter's costs."

So, this is quite the racket the NIAID has going. First, it helps create the virus, and then it gets royalty payments for the supposed 'vaccine!'

Reference ulterior motives of others (in this case, pharmaceutical company profits)

Promote commercial products
Web archiving and Archive-IT have opportunities and limitations. We hope that sharing our results and observations here and in our article will help spur other researchers to use web archives for misinformation and other research. We also hope that development on web archiving tools is enhanced to capture interconnected information, social media, paywalled and subscription content, search and embedded video and graphical content.

### Prepandemic Antivaccination Websites' COVID-19 Vaccine Behavior: Content Analysis of Archived Websites

**Samantha Kaplan**<sup>1</sup>; **Megan von Isenburg**<sup>1</sup>; **Lucy Waldrop**<sup>1</sup>  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Article</th>
<th>Authors</th>
<th>Cited by</th>
<th>Tweetations (4)</th>
<th>Metrics</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

**Abstract**

**Background:**
The onset of the COVID-19 pandemic and the concurrent development of vaccines offered a rare and somewhat unprecedented opportunity to study antivaccination behavior as it formed over time via the use of archived versions of websites.

**Objective:**
This study aims to assess how existing antivaccination websites modified their content to address COVID-19 vaccines and pandemic restrictions.

**Methods:**
Using a preexisting collection of 25 antivaccination websites curated by the IvyPlus Web Collection Program prior to the pandemic and crawled every 6 months via Archive-IT, we conducted a content analysis to see how these websites acknowledged or ignored COVID-19 vaccines and pandemic restrictions. Websites were assessed for financial behaviors such as having storefronts, mention of COVID-19 vaccines in general or by manufacturer name, references to personal freedom such as masking, safety concerns like side effects, and skepticism of science.

*https://duke.is/8rdx6*
Thank you!

REFERENCES


UNESCO. RECORDS OF THE GENERAL CONFERENCE, 32ND SESSION, PARIS, 29 SEPTEMBER TO 17 OCTOBER. LONDON, UK: UNESCO; 2003.